

**COOPERATIVE OF TEAM GAMES TOURNAMENT TO ENHANCE
LEARNING OUTCOMES IN ENGLISH LEARNING**

Faidah Yusuf¹⁾, Hikmawati Usman²⁾, Muhammad Irfan³⁾, Latri Aras⁴⁾, Hardianto Rahman⁵⁾

^{1) 2) 3) 4) 5)} Universitas Negeri Makassar

| SUBMISSION TRACK | A B S T R A C T |
|--|--|
| Submitted : 27 December 2022 Accepted : 21 February 2023 Published : 18 March 2023 | <p>The challenge of teaching English to students with low academic achievement is what inspired this line of inquiry. The purpose of this research was to provide an explanation of how the Team Games Tournament was implemented Elementary class in order to improve the English learning outcomes of the pupils. The type of action research that was conducted in the classroom for the purpose of this study was approached from a qualitative point of view. A total of 24 students took part in this research project, both as instructors and as research subjects. As means of collecting data for the purpose of this investigation, observation reports, learning progress examinations, and documentation were utilized. The findings of the research are that the implementation of the Team Games Tournament was generally carried out in an effective manner. Less teacher activity was recorded during Cycle I Meeting I, which sufficient category, however, more teacher activity was recorded during Meeting II, which rated as "good." Because of this, the student's results in learning English have increased. The implementation of the Team Games Tournament learning model in an educational of elementary school to improve the learning outcomes for students has been shown to be beneficial.</p> |
| KEYWORDS | |
| Cooperative Learning Learning Outcomes of English Team Games Tournament | |
| CORRESPONDENCE | |
| E-mail: faidah.yusuf@unm.ac.id | |

Introduction

The learning process tends to be monotonous in teaching (Ma & Coogler, 2020). The teacher is not just conveying the material, but the teacher must be able to help a lesson be more effective and interesting by choosing a learning model that is applied to students so that the material or teaching material delivered makes students interested in learning the material, which will have an impact on increasing learning activity. students in the learning process.

In the process of learning activities, the teacher has not used a learning model that can stimulate students to be active and interested in participating in learning activities (Kaybiyaynen & Kaybiyaynen, 2015). Centered learning student" Based on the results of observations of the learning process carried out in elementary school, it is still centered on teachers during the learning process, and there are still many teachers using the lecture method to explain the material presented (Hu et al., 2021). The activity that occurs is that students only hear and see when learning takes place, so the condition of obtaining watching, seeing while teaching, even the teacher Classes to only give assignments to get subject scores.

While the results of interviews with teachers of Elementary class, researchers obtained data on student learning outcomes that were classified as low in English subjects. It was found that the minimum completeness criterion for English subjects was 70. The results of learning English from 24 students were 17 students who did not reach the minimum mastery criteria. This can happen because of several things including Teacher aspects (1) the teacher does not involve students in learning; (2) the teacher's lack of

habits in using learning models. Student aspects (1) students' ability to understand the material is still very difficult; (2) students find it difficult to focus during learning. Based on these problems, a learning model is needed that is able to make the classroom atmosphere fun and make students interested in learning material so that it can increase student activity in the learning process (Prencipe & Tell, 2001). One of the learning models that can be used is the Team Games Tournament learning model. which places students in study groups consisting of four to five students who have different abilities, genders, and ethnicities.

According to Tseng et al., (2016), the Team Games Tournament learning model is a type of learning that is easy to apply and involves the activities of all students without any difference in status. This learning model includes 5 stages namely class presentation, games, tournament, and awarding (Williamson, 2007). Team Games Tournament learning model will change the learning from that was teacher-centered to the student. This is relevant to previous research conducted by mBakla & Mehdiyev, (2022) regarding the learning process of the Team Games Tournament, entitled "Application of the Team Games Tournament Learning Model to Increase Student Learning Activity for learning English vocabulary (Susanto et al., 2021), which showed the result that the application of the model learning for the Team Games Tournament can increase student learning activity in the learning process. Implementing team games tournaments in elementary schools can have a positive impact on students' physical, social, and emotional well-being, and can help them develop valuable skills that can benefit them in the future.

Based on the problems that have been formulated, the purpose of this research is to describe the application of the Team Games Tournament to improve student learning outcomes. as a theoretical reference and provide information about the application of the Team Games Tournament learning model to improve student learning outcomes. For prospective researchers, as scientific experience, and as relevant reference material for other researchers. This study's findings should benefit students by making them smarter, piquing their interest in learning, and helping them perform better in English classes. The research questions, what are cooperative of team games tournament to enhance learning outcomes in English learning? Therefore, this study should help teachers figure out how to use creative and new ways of teaching and learning to help students do better in school.

Literature Review

Learning Model Team Games Tournament

When it comes to learning, the model plays a crucial role. (Steinkuehler, 2009) says that the learning model is "a strategy or pattern that is used as a guide to planning learning in the classroom." The learning model specifies how knowledge will be acquired. This document explains the course's goals, activities, how the classroom is set up, and how to teach (Veloo et al., 2016). The learning model gives teachers a guideline to follow when making lesson plans and giving lessons. It is a set of ideas that explain how to organize learning experiences in a way that helps meet certain learning goals.

The learning model can be seen as a pattern that is used to put together a curriculum, organize materials, and tell teachers what to do in class. The learning model can be thought of as a set of ideas that explain how to organize learning experiences in a way that helps you reach your learning goals. "cooperative learning" is a way for students to learn in which they work together in small groups to solve

problems (Erickson & Sammons-Lohse, 2020). "A cooperative learning model is a set of learning activities that students do in groups in order to reach the learning goals that have been set. The cooperative model is a way of learning that is done in groups of eight people who work together and help each other reach learning goals."

The Team Games Tournament learning model encourages students to learn while playing. This learning model is great for elementary schools because it makes it easier for students to work together and helps them learn more (Elizabeth, 2020). TGT is an easy-to-use learning model that teachers and students can use as peer tutors in the classroom to help students learn in a variety of ways. In addition, TGT also contains elements of a game. "Team Games Tournament" is a way to learn in which students are put into study groups of five to six people with different skills, genders, and backgrounds (Firdaus et al., 2020). Sibomana stated that "in the team game tournament, students play games with members of other teams to get scores for their respective teams." whereas "the TGT (Team Games Tournament) learning model is a learning model that involves students in learning activities by being formed in groups that have different abilities." In group work, the teacher assigns tasks to each group. If there are group members who do not understand the tasks assigned, then other group members are responsible for providing answers or explaining (Williamson, 2007). Based on some of these experts' opinions, we can say that the Team Games Tournament learning model is a way for students with different skills to learn Games together in a study group. steps for using the *Team Games Tournament*, namely: presentation in class, teams, tournament, award.

Learning Outcomes

are abilities that children acquire after going through learning activities. Students will get the results of the learning process in the form of values or behaviors. In learning activities, the teacher usually sets learning goals. Students who are successful in learning are those who succeed in achieving instructional goals. "Learning outcomes are the culmination of a process that has been carried out in learning." The conclusion will be followed by a follow-up or improvement. Changes in student behavior can be seen as indicators of the achievement of learning outcomes. Factors that affect learning outcomes (Nazaruddin & Rahmawati, 2020) include internal and external factors.

Instrumental considerations the existence and application of instrument factors are determined by the anticipated learning results. These factors are anticipated to contribute to the achievement of the planned learning objectives. These elements consist of curriculum facilities and instructors.

Research Method

This study employed a mixed method (Dawadi et al., 2021). Through observation, researchers get an idea of what all the teacher and student activities are during the learning process. Classroom action research (CAR) is the research approach employed for this study such as planning, implementing; observing; and reflecting (McDonald, 2005). These four stages become one part that is interrelated to form a cycle. In class action research, the goal is to find solutions to problems that come up in class, increase teacher activity and the quality of how learning is put into practice in class, boost self-confidence and motivation to learn, and improve how well students learn. Action research in the classroom can also help students learn different ways to learn, how to run a class, and how to use the right media and learning resources.

Sample

This study focuses on a elementary class in grade 3 with 24 students. The setting in this study was an elementary school in Makassar, with the aim of improving student learning outcomes in English subjects. The use of learning models that are still not applied by teachers to increase student activity and learning outcomes, so it becomes a consideration for researchers to conduct research in elementary schools in Makassar

Research Design

Depending on the type of research, which is action research, the action plan has two cycles, and so on, until the goals set for two cycles are met. Park, (2021) suggests "there are four stages in carrying out a class action, namely: 1) planning (planning), 2) implementation (acting), 3) observing (observing), and 4) reflection (reflection). This planning stage is a preparation for learning English using the Team Games Tournament Learning Model. Researchers develop action plans with class teachers, to prepare learning materials, review lesson plans that have been submitted, compile student worksheets, prepare observation sheets regarding teacher activities and student activities during learning activities, and compile evaluations for each end of the cycle to find out student learning outcomes.

During the planning stage, the teacher and researcher talk about what needs to be done to get ready for this research. The researcher discusses with the class II teacher the description of the application of the model learning Team Games Tournament in learning English. Make a Learning Implementation Plan that needs to be prepared using the Team Games Tournament learning model. Compiling Student Worksheets (worksheets) and evaluation questions that will be given to students. Researchers prepared observation sheets regarding teacher activities and student activities during the learning process. Develop an evaluation tool for the end of each cycle to find out student learning outcomes.

The implementation of the plan that has been prepared by the researcher and the class teacher. This action is meant to improve situations or ways of learning in class that hasn't been up to par. During the implementation stage, the Team Games Tournament Learning Model is used to help people learn English. The researcher talks about the learning implementation plan that has been made, as well as the actions that teachers, students, and researchers take. The researcher watches the teachers and students do everything they do that has to do with the Team Games Tournament learning model. At this stage, the researcher watches the teachers and students do everything they do that has to do with the Team Games Tournament learning model. The researcher came up with a format for the implementation technique, which is made up of teacher-made teaching activity sheets and student-made learning activity sheets. The last stage of the cycle. At this stage, the teacher and researcher talked about the results from the observation stage, which were collected and then analyzed. If, at this point, the Team Games Tournament isn't helping students learn what they need to, the teacher and researcher can decide whether to keep going or not in the next cycle.

Data Collection

Observation, testing, and documentation were used in this classroom action research. The Team Games Tournament (TGT) learning model is a way to collect data by watching the steps a teacher takes during the learning process. According to Karl Weich (Bundu, 2016, p. 86), "observation" is defined as "selecting, changing, and recording a

series of behaviors and situations with respect to something or someone.” Questions-based tests are administered at the conclusion of the learning process. These questions are used in a direct question-and-answer system between the teacher and students. Documentation is a technique that is used while teaching and learning. It takes the form of pictures of what students are doing while they are learning, the results of what they are learning, and other documents that are used for research.

Data Analysis

The technique used is a qualitative data analysis technique. Qualitative research data were obtained through observation. Observations were made on student learning activities and teacher performance. In the observation of the results of this observation, which is the qualitative data from this study, observations will be made and written down. This data can be in the form of information in the form of sentences about the observations made. Quantitative data is in the form of student learning outcomes and In this study, indicators of success were looked at from two different points of view: the learning process and the results of the learning process. In this study, indicators of success were looked at from two different points of view: the learning process and the results of the learning.

Result and Discussion

The researcher playing the role of the doer and the teacher of grade 3 playing the role of the observer, which consisted of 24 students. While the goal of this study is to teach English to class elementary school students, the learning process is carried out using the Teams Games Tournament Learning Model. This study talks about the research results that show an improvement in learning outcomes, actions taken by researchers, and student learning activities after using the Team Games Tournament learning model to teach English.

Learning activities

Fun and competitive games can increase students' activities to learn and actively participate in learning. By incorporating game elements into learning, students will feel more interested and involved in learning activities. In cycle 1 Student Activities are still less focused on paying attention to learning, and lack of discussion of product design problem solving with their group mates. Student activity in the learning process using the Team Games Tournament learning model in cycle II has increased and is in the good category, because students are used to and understand the application of the Team Games Tournament learning model so that students are actively involved in learning and active in solving problems. The results of student observations in the implementation of English learning with the application of the Team Games Tournament learning model can be described qualitatively in student learning activities as follows:

Activities at the class presentation stage, namely introducing classical learning material. At this stage there are 3 indicators, namely students listening to the objectives and procedures for learning activities to be carried out, students listening to the subject matter, and students reading the subject matter in turn. The results obtained at the first meeting were in the good category, while the second meeting was in the good category.

Activities at the stage of forming groups or teams. At this stage there are 3 indicators, namely the teacher divides students into five groups consisting of five to six students, each group is heterogeneous and distributes learning sheets, the teacher observes

each discussion group activity, and the teacher guides students in working on the sheets. student work. The results obtained at the first meeting were in the adequate category while at the second meeting the category was good.

Activities at the stage of implementing games. At this stage there are 3 indicators, namely students listening to the steps and rules of games, students preparing to play games, and students carrying out games. The results obtained at meeting I were in the sufficient category while at meeting II it was also in good category.

Activities at the tournament stage. At this stage there are 3 indicators, namely students listening to the tournament rules explained by the teacher, students carrying out tournaments (tournaments are held simultaneously with the implementation of games), and students playing tournament games in accordance with teacher guidance. The results obtained at meeting I were in the sufficient category. while at the second meeting it was also in the good category.

Activities at the group appreciation stage. At this stage there are 3 indicators, namely students listening to group score announcements, students receiving awards or prizes (prizes are given to the group that gets the highest score), and students listen to motivation for groups that get low scores or have not received awards. The results obtained at the meeting I category less. while at the second meeting it was also in the good category.

Learning Outcomes

The TGT model can improve student learning outcomes because students learn actively and participate in learning. In addition, the TGT model also allows students to help and teach each other, thereby increasing the overall understanding and skills of students.

| No. | Name of Student | Before Using TGT | Using TGT | | Information |
|-----|-----------------|------------------|-----------|----------|-------------|
| | | | Cycle I | Cycle II | |
| 1 | CS | 50 | 60 | 60 | increased |
| 2 | CKP | 26 | 35 | 80 | increased |
| 3 | KK | 65 | 68.67 | 100 | increased |
| 4 | ZZ | 45 | 59 | 66.67 | increased |
| 5 | D | 46,67 | 85 | 100 | increased |
| 6 | FF | 73,33 | 53.33 | 66.67 | Increased |
| 7 | UU | 30 | 33.33 | 60 | Increased |
| 8 | FR | 30 | 86.67 | 90 | Increased |
| 9 | FY | 45 | 46.67 | 73.33 | Increased |
| 10 | LM | 20 | 40 | 66.67 | Increased |
| 11 | JU | 39 | 75 | 100 | Increased |
| 12 | MUH | 30 | 60 | 100 | Increased |
| 13 | RAY | 33,33 | 46.67 | 86 | Increased |
| 14 | KUY | 35 | 60 | 100 | Increased |
| 15 | FAY | 53 | 50 | 60 | Increased |
| 16 | MAL | 53,33 | 60 | 80 | Increased |
| 17 | KR | 60 | 70 | 100 | Increased |
| 18 | DRGH | 40 | 60 | 73.33 | Increased |
| 19 | NN | 45 | 45 | 68.67 | Increased |
| 20 | HRN | 33,33 | 60 | 93.33 | Increased |
| 21 | ST | 40 | 80 | 100 | Increased |
| 22 | LMK | 46,67 | 65 | 80 | Increased |
| 23 | IO | 55 | 70 | 73.33 | Increased |
| 24 | CC | 45 | 65 | 93.33 | Increased |

| | | | |
|---------------|-------------|-------------|----------|
| Total score | 753.00 | 1,434.34 | 1,971.33 |
| Average value | 41.83333333 | 59.76416667 | 82.13875 |
| Persent (%) | 31.38 | 59.76 | 82.14 |
| Category | Poor | Sufficient | Good |

Table 1. Recapitulation of Cycle I and II Test Results

Student learning outcomes in cycle I show that the research that has not been carried out has achieved the expected not success before. The class average value in cycle I was 59.76% and was in the sufficient category. However, this achievement has exceeded the previously established research success indicator, namely the percentage of classical learning completeness is 59%. The learning outcomes obtained from 24 students, namely 6 students with a percentage of 59%, can be said that the learning process and student learning outcomes have not increased. However, the researchers come to the next cycle, Student learning outcomes in cycle II show that the research that has been carried out has achieved the expected success before. The class average value in cycle II was 82.14% and was in the Good category. However, this achievement has exceeded the previously established research success indicator, namely the percentage of classical learning completeness is 80%. The learning outcomes obtained from 24 students, namely 21 students with a percentage of 82.14%, can be said that the learning process and student learning outcomes have increased.

Discussion

Two cycles of Classroom Action Research (CAR) procedures were used to conduct this study. Based on observations of teacher teaching activities and student learning activities using the Team Games Tournament learning model for elementary school students in Makassar, analysis of test data on student learning outcomes from meetings I and II, what transpired during the teaching and learning process can be recorded to be used as a reflection in cycle I, specifically as follows: The teacher's use of the Team Games Tournament learning model still has some flaws that are either not fixed or are forgotten. The teacher still struggles to guide and direct students in games and tournaments, which causes commotion in the classroom. Students' activities continue to be less focused on paying attention and to lack group discussions about how to solve problems with product design. Student learning outcomes indicate that I did not meet the cycle's desired outcome criteria. In cycle I, teacher teaching activities at meetings I and II fall under the "less" category, while meetings I and II fall under the "sufficient" category. Based on what was said above, the research results from cycle I have not been finished yet. Thus, cycle II will see the research team continue.

Based on the results of the analysis of the student learning outcomes test data from meetings I and II and the observations of teacher teaching activities and student learning activities through the application of the Team Games Tournament learning model in the English subject. It was found in cycle II that, in accordance with the learning strategy the teacher employed, the teacher had mastered the Team Games Tournament learning model, which has improved and is in a good category. The teacher is also able to teach students how to complete the tasks of the Team Games Tournament learning model by guiding and counseling them as they go through the learning process. The teacher is also able to help students carry out the steps of the Team Games Tournament learning model by directing and advising them. Student activity in the learning process using the *Team Games Tournament* in cycle II has increased and is in a good category because students

are used to and understand the application of the Team Games Tournament learning model so that students are actively involved in learning and active in finding and solving problems. Student learning outcomes in cycle II show that the research that has been carried out has achieved the expected success before. By using the Team Games Tournament learning model in English classes, it is possible to say that both the learning process and the students' learning outcomes have improved. This means that there is no need to use the model in the next cycle.

Implementing team games tournaments in elementary schools can be beneficial such as first, encourages teamwork which is team games tournaments can help students learn the importance of working together to achieve a common goal. Students can learn how to communicate effectively with their team members, delegate tasks, and trust one another. These skills can be beneficial both in and out of the classroom. Second, promotes physical activity that team games tournaments can provide a fun and engaging way for students to engage in physical activity, which can help promote a healthy lifestyle. Regular physical activity can help reduce the risk of obesity and improve overall physical and mental health. Third, develops sportsmanship that participating in team games tournaments can help students develop good sportsmanship. They can learn how to win and lose gracefully, respect their opponents, and follow the rules of the game. Fourth, enhances social skills that team games tournaments can provide opportunities for students to interact with their peers and develop their social skills. They can learn how to make friends, work as a team, and develop leadership skills. Lastly, increasing motivation and engagement that team games tournaments can be a fun and exciting way to engage students in learning. They can provide a break from traditional classroom activities and motivate students to participate in physical activity and teamwork.

Overall, implementing team games tournaments in elementary schools can have a positive impact on students' physical, social, and emotional well-being, and can help them develop valuable skills that can benefit them in the future.

The results obtained in cycle I have not been carried out properly. This is because there are still some deficiencies in both teacher activities and student activities. These include the fact that the teacher still doesn't tell students to listen and pay attention, that the teacher still has trouble guiding and directing students during games and tournaments, which causes chaos in the classroom, and that students don't talk with their group mates about how to solve problems in product design. Team Games Tournament learning model's flaws or weaknesses are that not all students contribute their own money to learning activities and that there is a chance of chaos if the teacher can't keep the class under control. These flaws are similar to what they said. good. Based on the results of observations of teacher teaching activities and student learning activities, as well as the fact that student learning outcomes improved from cycle I to cycle II, it can be said that the application of the Team Games Tournament learning model to improve English learning outcomes.

Therefore, studying team games tournaments as a means of learning English in elementary school can have several positive outcomes. By engaging in team games and competitions, children can develop their English language skills in a fun and interactive way. This can help make learning English more enjoyable and encourage children to practice their language skills more frequently. Participating in team games tournaments can also provide a more immersive environment for language learning, where children are forced to communicate with each other in English. This can help them improve their speaking, listening, and comprehension skills, as well as expand their vocabulary and

knowledge of English grammar. Additionally, team games tournaments can help children develop important social skills such as teamwork, communication, and cooperation, which are essential for success in both academic and professional settings.

Conclusion

This study is cooperative of team games tournament to enhance learning outcomes in English learning. The Team Games Tournament learning model of student learning outcomes has increased. The findings of this research found, first learning activities and learning outcomes for applying cycle I and cycle II. In conclusion, using team games tournaments as a method for learning English in elementary school can have many benefits for children those are it can make learning English more enjoyable, provide a more immersive learning experience, and help children develop important language and social skills that can benefit them in their future academic and professional endeavors. Based on what the researchers found, the authors make suggestions for teachers who use the Team Games Tournament learning model, to help students learn more. Things should also get better for future researchers and those who want to study the Team Games Tournament learning model. as well as nesting researchers to conduct research with a wider range of references.

REFERENCES

- Bakla, A., & Mehdiyev, E. (2022). A qualitative study of teacher-created interactive videos versus YouTube videos in flipped learning. *E-Learning and Digital Media*, 19(5), 495–514. <https://doi.org/10.1177/20427530221107789>
- Dawadi, S., Shrestha, S., & Giri, R. A. (2021). Mixed-Methods Research: A Discussion on its Types, Challenges, and Criticisms. *Journal of Practical Studies in Education*, 2(2), 25–36. <https://doi.org/10.46809/jpse.v2i2.20>
- Elizabeth, K. (2020). Implementing NHT and TGT to Enhance Students' Knowledge of Passive and Active Voice Construction: Comparative Study. *Acuity Journal*, 4(2), 69–93.
- Erickson, L. v, & Sammons-Lohse, D. (2020). Learning through video games: The impacts of competition and cooperation. *E-Learning and Digital Media*, 18(1), 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2042753020949983>
- Firdaus, F., Subchan, W., & Narulita, E. (2020). Developing STEM-based TGT learning model to improve students' process skills. *JPBI (Jurnal Pendidikan Biologi Indonesia)*, 6(3). <https://doi.org/10.22219/jpbi.v6i3.12249>
- Hu, Y. H., Asistido, R. L., & Villanueva, M. J. O. (2021). Influencing variables and implications in the teacher-student relationships. *European Journal of Educational Research*, 10(3), 1317–1327. <https://doi.org/10.12973/EU-JER.10.3.1317>
- Kaybiyaynen, D.-A., & Kaybiyaynen, A. (2015). University as a center of project-based learning of school students. *2015 International Conference on Interactive Collaborative Learning (ICL)*. <https://doi.org/10.1109/icl.2015.7318168>
- Ma, J., & Coogler, K. (2020). Learning-by-Doing: Development of Project-Based Manufacturing Courses. *2019 ASEE Annual Conference & Exposition Proceedings*. <https://doi.org/10.18260/1-2-33055>
- McDonald, S. (2005). Studying actions in context: a qualitative shadowing method for organizational research. *Qualitative Research*, 5(4), 455–473. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1468794105056923>

- Nazaruddin, I., & Rahmawati, P. (2020). Development of Innovative Student Worksheets Based on Project-Based Learning: Improve the Learning Outcomes. *Jurnal Inovasi Pendidikan Dasar*, 6(1), 31–38. <https://doi.org/10.22236/jipd.v6i1.152>
- Park, E. J. (2021). Affordances and challenges of mixed-methods needs analysis for the development of ESP courses. *Language Teaching Research Quarterly*, 23, 12–22. <https://doi.org/10.32038/ltrq.2021.23.03>
- Prencipe, A., & Tell, F. (2001). Inter-project learning: processes and outcomes of knowledge codification in project-based firms. *Research Policy*, 30(9), 1373–1394. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s0048-7333\(01\)00157-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0048-7333(01)00157-3)
- Steinkuehler, C. (2009). Games, Learning and Society. *E-Learning and Digital Media*, 6(1), 1–3. <https://doi.org/10.2304/elea.2009.6.1.1>
- Susanto, H., Tinggi, S., & Bontang, T. (2021). An Analysys About Students' Troubles in Acquisition English Vocabulary. *Journey: Journal of English Language and Pedagogy*, 4(2), 46–50. <http://ejurnal.budiutomomalang.ac.id/index.php/journey>
- Tseng, T.-L., Akundi, A., Wu, T., Lin, Y., & Jack, H. (2016). Evaluating Individual Learning Effectiveness on Project-Based Learning Methodology by Comparing Team-Based and Individually Assigned Projects. *2016 ASEE Annual Conference & Exposition Proceedings*. <https://doi.org/10.18260/p.26753>
- Veloo, A., Md-Ali, R., & Chairany, S. (2016). Using Cooperative Teams-Game-Tournament in 11 Religious School to Improve Mathematics Understanding and Communication. In *Malaysian Journal of Learning and Instruction* (Vol. 13, Issue 2). <http://mjli.uum.edu.my>
- Williamson, B. (2007). Viewpoints: Teaching and learning with games? *Learning, Media and Technology*, 32(1), 99–105. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17439880601141492>